

REPORT TO: Planning Committee
MEETING DATE: 6 December 2022
BY: Executive Director for Place
SUBJECT: Application for Planning Permission for Consideration

6

Application No. **22/00506/LBC**
Proposal Replacement windows and door
Location **10 Balcarres Road
Musselburgh
East Lothian
EH21 7SD**

Applicant Musselburgh Old Course Golf Club
Per PSAS

RECOMMENDATION Application Refused

REPORT OF HANDLING

PROPOSAL

The property to which this application relates is a two storey, stone built, semi-detached building which is listed as being of special architectural or historic interest (Category B). So too are its lengths of low stone wall that enclose the east and north boundaries of its open plan front garden. The building is located close to, but is outwith, the Musselburgh Conservation Area.

In August 2021, listed building consent (Ref: 21/00836/LBC) was sought for the replacement of all of the existing single glazed aluminium framed windows with double glazed UPVC framed windows displayed within the front (east), side (south) and rear (west) elevations of the building. The proposals also included the replacement of an aluminium framed glazed door with a UPVC framed glazed door located at first floor level in the rear (west) elevation of the building. Listed building consent 21/00836/LBC was withdrawn by the applicant's agent in November 2021 following discussions with the **Council's Planning Service** team in which it was advised that the use of modern materials such as UPVC would neither preserve nor enhance the character and appearance of the listed building.

In December 2021, listed building consent (Ref: 21/01329/LBC) was granted for the replacement of (i) all of the existing single glazed aluminium framed windows with double glazed timber framed sash and case windows within the front (east), side (south) and rear (west) elevations of the building; and (ii) an aluminium framed glazed door with a timber framed glazed door located at first floor level within the rear (west) elevation of the building. Listed building consent 21/01329/LBC has not been implemented but remains extant until 15th December 2024.

Listed building consent is now sought for the replacement of (i) all of the existing single glazed aluminium framed windows displayed within the front (east), side (south) and rear (west) elevations of the building with UPVC frames; and (ii) the existing aluminium framed glazed door with a UPVC framed glazed door located at first floor level in the rear (west) elevation of the building.

The existing windows displayed within the front (east), side (south) and rear (west) elevations of the building are all white coloured, single glazed, top hung, aluminium framed windows of a 1 over 1 glazing pattern. It is proposed to replace the existing windows with UPVC framed, double glazed windows with a different opening method (in that the bottom window panes are proposed to be open outwards as opposed to them being fixed).

The existing glazed door, located at first floor level, in the rear (west) elevation of the building also has white coloured aluminium frames. It is proposed to replace the existing glazed door with a glazed door with UPVC frames.

DEVELOPMENT PLAN

Material to the determination of the application is Section 14 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 and the Scottish Government's policy on development affecting a listed building given in the Historic Environment Policy for Scotland (HEPS): April 2019 and Scottish Planning Policy: June 2014.

The Historic Environment Policy Statement and Scottish Planning Policy echo the statutory requirements of Section 14 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 that in considering whether to grant listed building consent for any works to a listed building the planning authority shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

Policy CH1 (Listed Buildings) of the adopted East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018 is relevant to the determination of this application.

Also material to the determination of the application is supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG) on 'Cultural Heritage and the Built Environment' adopted by the Council on 30th October 2018. The SPG expands on policies that are set out in the East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018 provides policy guidance on replacement windows in buildings which are listed as being of special architectural or historic interest.

REPRESENTATION

Two objections to this application have been received. The main grounds of objection are:

(i) the proposed UPVC framed replacement windows are unacceptable and would

neither preserve nor enhance the special architectural or historic interest of this B-listed building contrary to Policy CH1 of the adopted East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018;

(ii) the existing windows within the building should be replaced with timber framed sash and case windows (as was approved in application 21/01329/LBC) to reinstate the original materials and opening methods of the existing windows within the building which are major elements of its special architectural and historic character; and

(iii) both the existing aluminium framed windows and the proposed UPVC framed windows mar the quality of the building which is a fine example of a purpose-built golf club and occupies a prominent position with the streetscape.

COMMUNITY COUNCIL

None.

PLANNING ASSESSMENT

Historic Environment Scotland (HES), in their consultation response to this application, state that 10 Balcarres Road was built as the clubhouse for the Edinburgh Burgess Golfing Society in 1875. They state that, at some point, the original windows (which are presumed to have been timber with sashes) have been replaced with aluminium examples that detract from the building's character. They state that their preference would be for the proposed replacement windows to be replaced with timber sashes as was approved in December last year. They also state that even if only the front windows were replaced in timber this would be a considerable conservation gain. HES note that the proposed replacement windows are top hung UPVC windows with limited detail provided. They state that the proposed replacement UPVC framed windows would adversely affect the character of the building. However, they state that if the principle of replacement plastic units is viewed as being acceptable, the replacement windows should take the form of vertically sliding sashes with further details being provided on the design, sections and placement of units in the walling.

The listed building occupies a prominent position on the west side of Balcarres Road. The existing windows displayed within the front (east), side (south) and rear (west) elevations of the building are of a non-traditional aluminium frame construction which detract from the special architectural or historic interest of the listed building. So too does the aluminium framed glazed door located at first floor level in the rear (west) elevation of the building. With the exception of the aluminium framed windows and aluminium framed glazed door, the existing building displays traditional features and materials including pitched roof slopes clad in slates and external stone walls. These features are defining characteristics of the special architectural or historic interest of it.

With regard to listed buildings the policy guidance set out in the SPG states that original windows should be retained and, where necessary, repaired. Only where repair is shown to be impossible should replacement be accepted. Replacement windows will normally be required to exactly match the original window in all respects, including proportions of the window opening, opening methods, materials, colour, astragal profile if appropriate and glazing. Permission will not be granted for a replacement window that is visibly different to an existing original window.

It is proposed to replace the existing aluminium framed windows within the front (east), side (south) and rear (west) elevations of the building with non-traditional UPVC frames. The proposed UPVC framed windows would be double glazed (instead of single glazed) and their bottom panes would open outwards (as opposed to them being fixed). Notwithstanding that the existing aluminium framed windows displayed within the

building are not the original windows designed for it, the proposed replacement UPVC framed windows would, due to the different construction material of their frames and due to the bottom panes of them being of a different opening mechanism, significantly change the character and appearance of the listed building in a manner that would seriously harm the integrity and special architectural or historic interest of it. Accordingly, the proposed replacement windows would have a significant visual impact on, and thus would be harmful to, the special architectural or historic interest of the listed building. They would harmfully disrupt and draw focus from the architectural form, character and integrity of the listed building. They would not preserve or enhance, but instead would be harmful to, the special architectural or historic interest of the listed building.

It is also proposed to replace the existing aluminium framed glazed door located at first floor level within the rear (west) elevation of the listed building. It would be of the same size and proportions of the existing door to which it would replace with the only difference being that it would be have UPVC frames. However, the modern UPVC framing of it would change the character and appearance of the listed building in a manner that would harm the integrity and special architectural or historic interest of it. Accordingly, the proposed replacement door would not preserve or enhance, but instead would be harmful to, the special architectural or historic interest of the listed building.

On these considerations, the proposals are contrary to Policy CH1 of the adopted East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018, the Historic Environment Policy for Scotland (HEPS): April 2019, the Council's supplementary Planning Guidance on 'Cultural Heritage and the Built Environment' and with Scottish Planning Policy: June 2014.

In conclusion, the proposals are considered not to be in accordance with the provisions of the stated relevant Development Plan policies and there are no material considerations which outweigh the fact that the proposals do not accord with the Development Plan.

REASONS FOR REFUSAL:

- 1 The proposed replacement UPVC framed windows would, due to the different construction material of their frames and due to the bottom panes of them being of a different opening mechanism, have a significant visual impact on, and thus would be harmful to, the special architectural or historic interest of the listed building. They would not preserve or enhance, but instead would be harmful to, the special architectural or historic interest of the listed building contrary to Policy CH1 of the adopted East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018, the Historic Environment Policy for Scotland (HEPS): April 2019, the Council's supplementary Planning Guidance on 'Cultural Heritage and the Built Environment' and with Scottish Planning Policy: June 2014.
- 2 The proposed replacement UPVC framed door would change the character and appearance of the listed building in a manner that would harm the integrity and special architectural or historic interest of it. It would not preserve or enhance, but instead would be harmful to, the special architectural or historic interest of the listed building contrary to Policy CH1 of the adopted East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018, the Historic Environment Policy for Scotland (HEPS): April 2019, the Council's supplementary Planning Guidance on 'Cultural Heritage and the Built Environment' and with Scottish Planning Policy: June 2014.