OFFICER REPORT

18th February 2020

App No. 19/01082/P Application registered on 20th December

2019

Target Date 19th February 2020

Proposal Conversion of former sawmill building to

form 1 house with domestic workshop and SDELL N

associated works

CDEL N

Location Nunraw Barns Old Sawmill

Garvald Bad Neighbour N

Gifford Development

East Lothian

APPLICANT: **Mr A Short**Is this application to be approved as a departure from structure/local plan? N

c/o McDonald Architecture & Design Per Derek McDonald Townhead Steading East Saltoun Tranent East Lothian EH34 5EB

DECISION TYPE: Application Refused

PLANNING ASSESSMENT

This application relates to a derelict vacant former sawmill building located at Nunraw to the south of the village of Garvald and to the land to the immediate north, east and west of the building. The site is in total some 1685.00 m sq in area and is located within the countryside as defined by Policy DC1 of the adopted East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018.

The building is not listed as being of special architectural or historic interest and it is not within a conservation area, but is within the Danskine to Whitecastle Special Landscape Area.

The building sits on the north side of an access road leading into a group of former steading buildings at Nunraw Barns. The Nunraw Barns farmhouse sits to the west side of the access road. The former steading buildings sit to the north. The original steading buildings have been converted into houses through the grants of the planning permission and are occupied:

On 22 October 2004 planning permission 04/01306/FUL was granted retrospectively for the conversion of an agricultural building at Nunraw Barns to form one house. The building to which planning permission 04/01306/FUL related formed part of the east range of a larger group of stone built agricultural buildings at Nunraw Barns which at that time were derelict.

On 29 April 2010 planning permission (ref: 09/00413/FUL) was granted for the conversion of and alterations to the remaining original steading buildings of Nunraw Barns to form 2 houses, the change of use of the land adjacent to the steading buildings to residential use associated with the proposed conversion of the steading, including garden ground and hard surfaced car parking areas and for the erection of rubble sandstone walls on the site. Planning permission was also granted for the conversion of a former brick built piggery building to form one garage/workshop for each of the proposed 2 houses.

On 22 January 2013 planning permission(ref: 12/00907/P) was granted for design changes to the scheme of development the subject of planning permission 09/00413/FUL and for the addition of roof windows, solar panels and flues to the roof slopes of buildings. Those design changes comprise: (i) the building up of walls in natural rubble stone to form gable ends on the west range of the steading buildings with the consequential formation of a pedestrian access between them, (ii) the installation within the buildings of new window openings and the installation in them of new timber framed sash and case windows and, (iii) the installation in the buildings of new timber doors and glazed screens.

On 25 June 2015 planning permission ref: 15/00270/P was granted for alterations, extension and change of use of derelict steading and outbuildings located to the northwest of Nunraw Farmhouse at Nunraw Barns Sawmill to form 1 house with ancillary residential accommodation, domestic storage building and associated works.

Planning permission is now sought for alterations and change of use of the brick built former sawmill building to form 1 house and for the use of the land adjacent to it as garden ground. The building to be converted comprises a former sawmill which is single storey in height and has a rectangular footprint running adjacent to the access road. The walls of the building are constructed from rendered covered brick with a profiled asbestos sheeted roof. The window openings of the building have been bricked up while many of the doors have been removed. The building stands substantially intact. It is currently used for storage.

Alterations to the building include:

- (i) the removal of the profiled asbestos roof and its replacement with a dark grey sinusoidal steel roof; the pitch and the height of the roof would reflect the existing.
- (ii) the large door on the south elevation would be replaced with a new timber sliding door, and the 5 bricked up window openings would be enlarged and timber framed windows installed within the enlarged openings; additionally an existing door opening would be infilled;
- (iii) in the west elevation two bricked up window openings would be opened up and windows installed within them and;
- (iv) in the north elevation a new door opening with would be installed within 2 existing doorways, two new large openings would be formed and timer framed windows installed within them and the adjacent opening would be infilled with painted timber cladding and a new door;
- (v) in the east elevation it is proposed to install a new door with glazed side panels and at first floor level to form a new bay window;

(vi) the re-rendering of the building in grey stone coloured render.

A new bin store enclosure would be constructed adjacent to the eastern end of the north elevation of the building and an oil tank would be sited to the east of the building.

The property would be accessed via the existing access road to the south of the building. It is proposed to hardsurface an area to the east side of the building and to form two car parking spaces on it.

An area of ground to the east, north and west of the building and the area of hardstanding would be enclosed with a post and wire fence to provide garden ground for the building.

A 0.9m high stone wall would be erected along the northern edge of the access road to enclose the south boundary of the site which would replicate an existing nearby stone wall to the west.

In support of the application the applicant's agent has submitted a Design Statement. It states that the stone built former farm buildings were originally associated with the Nunraw Tower situated nearby. Further buildings were added in more modern materials after the tower was acquired by Cistercian Monks in the 1950s. The piggery and sawmill buildings were constructed at around this time in rendered brickwork with asbestos roofing and are shown on maps dating from the 1960s.

Within the Design Statement it is asserted that planning permission was granted for a similar proposal for the conversion of a modern brick building (Ref: 17/01189/P) to residential use at another farm in East Lothian. That planning application it is stated sets a precedent that is relevant to this application at Nunraw Barns.

Section 25 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 requires that the application be determined in accordance with the development plan, unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

The development plan is the approved Edinburgh and the adopted South East Scotland Strategic Development Plan (SESplan) June 2013 and the adopted East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018.

There are no policies within the approved South East Scotland Strategic Development Plan (SESplan) June 2013 that are of relevance to this application. Policies DC2 (Conversion of Rural Buildings to Housing), DC9 (Special Landscape Areas), DP2 (Design), DP5 (Extensions and Alterations to Existing Buildings) and T2 (General Transport Impact) of the adopted East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018 are relevant to the determination of the application.

Material to the determination of the application is Scottish Planning Policy: June 2014 and Planning Advice Note 72: Housing in the Countryside.

Planning Advice Note 72: Housing in the Countryside explains how the conversion or rehabilitation of rural buildings not only brings a building back to life but it may provide opportunities to sensitively conserve our built heritage, including buildings of merit which are not listed. The sympathetic restoration of buildings, which are structurally sound, largely intact, safety accessible and linked to water and other services maintains the character and distinctiveness of places.

No letters of objection to the application have been received.

Two letters of support have been received, stating that the building in question will in the fullness of time become derelict and at present is an eyesore. It is also stated that the proposal would allow a local family to remain in the village and that the footprint will not increase with the rebuild. These also state that the surrounding buildings have been brought back to life. The last remaining building is the old sawmill which unfortunately is the first structure one meets on entering the lane. To have this restored and made into a residence would enhance and complete Nunraw Barns.

The detailed works of alteration to facilitate the proposed conversion of the building would not be unsympathetic to the architectural form and character of the sawmill building. The proposed replacement windows, doors and screens by virtue of their form, style, materials and finishing would not be inappropriate to the character of the buildings. Similarly the proposed roof would preserve the overall utilitarian character of the building. The proposed area of hardstanding to be used for car parking, by virtue of its form, size, sale and positioning would not be harmful to the character and appearance of the area. The area the subject of the proposed change of use of agricultural land to garden ground and hardstanding area is relatively small in size and scale. In its association with the building the use of the surrounding land as garden ground for the proposed house would not appear intrusive, incongruous or exposed in its landscape setting.

On those matters the proposals are consistent with Policies DP2 and DP5 of the ELLDP 2018.

Policy DP5 requires that a proposed development should not adversely affect existing residential amenity. Accordingly it should not result in any significant loss of daylight, sunlight or privacy to neighbouring properties as a result of overshadowing or overlooking. Given the location of the building in relation to neighbouring residential properties the proposed use of the building as a house would not harmfully affect the amenity of the occupants of neighbouring residential properties through overlooking or overshadowing. On those matters of amenity the proposals do not conflict with Policy DP5 of the adopted East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018.

It is proposed to access the proposed house from the public road to the east of the proposed dwelling. Two car parking spaces would be provided. The Council's Road Services advises that they have no objection to this proposal and the proposals do not conflict with Policy T2 of the adopted East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018.

With regards to the Special Landscape Area, the Council Planning Policy Officer has confirmed that this proposal is unlikely to harm the openness and 'wild land' character of the SLA. It would not detract from the landscape character of the Danskine to Whitecastle Special Landscape Area consistent with Policy DC9 of the East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018.

The Council's Environmental Protection Service has no comment to make on the application.

The Council's Contaminated Land Officer raises no objection to the application subject to conditions.

Notwithstanding that the proposed alterations to the building would be sympathetic to the character and appearance of the building and the proposed layout would be sufficient to allow for the provision of sufficient amenity to its future occupants, the principle of the conversion of this building in the countryside to a house must be considered against the other policies of the ELLDP 2018 namely Policy DC2 (Conversion of Rural Buildings to Houses) of the ELLDP 2018.

The application site is in a countryside location to the south of Garvald characterised by a low density dispersed built form within an agricultural landscape. Nunraw Barns is not identified in the adopted ELLDP 2018 as being a settlement. By being specifically covered by Policy DC1 of the adopted ELLDP 2018 the application site is identified as being within a countryside location. The proposals must therefore be assessed against national, strategic and local planning policy relating to housing development in the countryside.

Policy DC2 of the adopted ELLDP 2018 supports the conversion of appropriate buildings in the countryside to a house where the existing building is:

- (i) worthy of retention by virtue of its architectural or historic character;
- (iii) the building is physically suitable for its intended use and any extensions or alterations are compatible with and should not do not harm any significant architectural or historic features;
- (iv) The building must stand substantially intact and shall not require significant demolition in order to be converted.

In this instance the building is substantially intact and does not require significant demolition to facilitate its conversion.

The steading buildings of Nunraw Barns are a complex of single-storey and two-storey buildings. They principally comprise a single-storey north range, a part single storey part two-storey south range and a part single storey part two-storey west range. The former buildings have largely been converted to housing or have had planning permission to do so. A single storey former piggery building is located to the northwest of the main group of steading buildings. That former piggery building is a brick building that was approved to be converted to an ancillary workshop/garage for houses formed within the steading through the grant of planning permission 09/00413/FUL.

The existing original steading buildings all have rubble sandstone walls and architectural features that make the buildings of architectural or historic merit. Together they form a tight grouping of traditional buildings or architectural merit typical of rural buildings found in other part of the countryside of East Lothian.

In contrast the building the subject of this application sits away from the traditional steading buildings, some 25m to the south of them, and therefore is outwith the main grouping of them. In terms of historic character, the applicant's submitted design statement states that the former sawmill building has been in place only since the 1960s, stating the building is of modern materials and construction. Therefore it is clear that the building is not of any historical importance and does not display any features of historic character. Moreover by its simple modern architectural form and appearance, its rendered brick construction and metal sheeting roofing the building is not worthy of retention by virtue of its architectural character and its conversion to a house would not meet the requirement of Policy DC4.

The Council's Planning Policy and Strategy Manager has been consulted on the proposal. He has stated that the former sawmill building is a type of building replicated in many areas. It is of brick construction, and has little or no architectural merit. It is not at all attractive. Its appearance is at odds with the historic stone buildings of the former steading buildings of Nunraw Barns.

On the above considerations the proposal for the change of use of the brick built former sawmill building to form 1 house is contrary to Policy DC2 of the adopted ELLDP 2018

The applicant's submitted Design Statement references that through the grant of planning permission 15/00270/P a former brick built piggery building to the east side of the group of the steading buildings of Nunraw Barns was retained and converted, which was of similar construction to the building the subject of this application. However that grant of planning permission allowed its conversion into a storage building to be used in association with the conversion of the traditional steading buildings to 1 house. As that building was not being converted into a house there was no requirement to demonstrate that it was a building worthy of retention by virtue of its architectural or historic character in accordance with the relevant development plan policy in force at that time.

On the matter of the applicant's agents assertion that the grant of planning permission for the conversion of modern brick building (Ref: 17/01189/P) to a house sets a precedent for this application, all applications must be assessed on their own merits against Development Plan policy and in the particular circumstances of their individual cases.

In the case of planning permission 17/01189/P it was concluded that the buildings that were to be converted into the proposed houses were of architectural merit and worthy of retention.

In the absence of material planning considerations that would outweigh the principle consideration that the former sawmill building is not a building worthy of retention by virtue of its architectural or historic character, the proposed conversion and change of use of the brick built former sawmill building to form 1 house is contrary to Policy DC2 of the adopted ELLDP 2018.

Reason for Refusal

The building is not of architectural merit or historic character and is not particularly attractive. It is not a building worthy of its retention and its conversion to a house would be contrary to Policy DC2 of the adopted ELLDP 2018.



18th February 2020

EAST LOTHIAN COUNCIL DECISION NOTICE

TOWN AND COUNTRY PLANNING (SCOTLAND) ACT 1997 TOWN AND COUNTRY PLANNING (DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT PROCEDURE) (SCOTLAND) REGULATIONS 2008

Mr A Short c/o McDonald Architecture & Design Per Derek McDonald Townhead Steading East Saltoun Tranent East Lothian EH34 5EB

APPLICANT: Mr A Short

With reference to your application registered on 20th December 2019 for planning permission under the above mentioned Acts and Regulations for the following development, viz:-

Conversion of former sawmill building to form 1 house with domestic workshop and associated works

at Nunraw Barns Old Sawmill Garvald Gifford East Lothian

East Lothian Council as the Planning Authority in exercise of their powers under the abovementioned Acts and Regulations hereby **REFUSE PLANNING PERMISSION** for the said development.

The reasons for the Council's refusal of planning permission are:-

The building is not of architectural merit or historic character and is not particularly attractive. It is not a building worthy of its retention and its conversion to a house would be contrary to Policy DC2 of the adopted ELLDP 2018.

The report on this application is attached to this Decision Notice and its terms shall be deemed to be incorporated in full in this Decision Notice.

Details of the following are given in the application report:

- the terms on which the Planning Authority based this decision;
- details of any variations made to the application in terms of Section 32A of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997.

The plans to which this decision relate are as follows:

Drawing No.	Revision No.	Date Received
MANU LITERATURE 1	-	19.12.2019
MANU LITERATURE 2	-	19.12.2019
MANU LITERATURE 3	-	19.12.2019
MANU LITERATURE 4	-	19.12.2019
AURA+.W1.02.A.C.001	-	19.12.2019
L()001	A	19.12.2019
L()002	A	19.12.2019
L()003	A	19.12.2019
L()004	A	19.12.2019
L()111	A	19.12.2019
L()121	A	19.12.2019
L()122	A	19.12.2019
L()301	-	19.12.2019
L()302	-	19.12.2019
L()006	A	20.12.2019
L()101	В	20.12.2019
L()102	В	20.12.2019

21st February 2020



Keith Dingwall Service Manager - Planning

NOTES

If the applicant is aggrieved by the decision to refuse permission for the proposed development, the applicant may require the planning authority to review the case under section 43A of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 within three months from the date of this notice. The notice of review should be addressed to the Clerk to the Local Review Body, Committee Team, Communications and Democratic Services, John Muir House, Haddington, East Lothian EH41 3HA.

If permission to develop land is refused or granted subject to conditions and the owner of the land claims that the land has become incapable of reasonably beneficial use in its existing state and cannot be rendered capable of reasonably beneficial use by the carrying out of any development which has been or would be permitted, the owner of the land may serve on the Planning Authority a purchase notice requiring the purchase of the owner of the land's interest in the land in accordance with Part 5 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997.