

**REPORT TO:** Planning Committee  
**MEETING DATE:** Wednesday 4 March 2020  
**BY:** Head of Development  
**SUBJECT:** Application for Planning Permission for Consideration

---

Application No. **19/01289/LBC**  
Proposal Erection of canopy  
Location **91 High Street  
Haddington  
East Lothian  
EH41 3ET**  
Applicant MNH (Haddington) Ltd  
Per Somner Macdonald Architects

**RECOMMENDATION** **Application Refused**

## **REPORT OF HANDLING**

### **PROPOSAL**

This application relates to the former George Hotel, a predominantly 18th century four storey building with crenulated tower, which is listed as being of special architectural or historic interest (Category B). It is within Haddington Conservation Area.

Listed building consent is sought for the addition of a glazed canopy that would abut, and project some 1.7 metres out from, the ground floor component of the front (west) elevation of the listed building. The glazed canopy would be supported by three stainless steel beams that would be affixed into the stonework of the building and three stainless steel posts that would be affixed into the low stone wall which runs parallel to, and abuts the south end of, the frontage of the listed building.

The proposed canopy would measure some 1.7 metres wide, some 3.5 metres long and some 2.5 metres to the top of its mono-pitched roof at its highest point above ground level. It would be fully glazed and its north and south sides would be open sided. It would extend over the entrance door and window on the front (west) elevation of the building.

Through separate application 19/01188/P planning permission is sought for erection of canopy. A separate report on application 19/01188/P is, at this time, on the Council's Scheme of Delegation List.

## **DEVELOPMENT PLAN**

Material to the determination of the application is Section 14 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 and the Scottish Government's policy on development affecting a listed building given in the Historic Environment Policy for Scotland (HEPS): April 2019 and Scottish Planning Policy: June 2014.

The Historic Environment Policy Statement and Scottish Planning Policy echo the statutory requirements of Section 14 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 that in considering whether to grant listed building consent for any works to a listed building the planning authority shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

Also material to the determination of the application is Section 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 and the Scottish Government's policy on development within a conservation area given in Scottish Planning Policy: June 2014.

Scottish Planning Policy echoes the statutory requirements of Section 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 that a planning authority must have regard to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of a conservation area in exercising its responsibilities in the determination of any application for planning permission for development affecting a conservation area. It is stated in Scottish Planning Policy that proposed development within conservation areas and proposals outwith which will impact on its appearance, character or setting, should preserve or enhance the character and appearance of the conservation area. Proposals that do not harm the character and appearance of the conservation area should be treated as preserving its character and appearance.

Also material to the determination of the application is supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG) on 'Cultural Heritage and the Built Environment' adopted by the Council on 30th October 2018. The SPG expands on policies that are set out in the East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018 and provides policy guidance on replacement windows in buildings which are listed as being of special architectural or historic interest.

Policies CH1 (Listed Buildings) and CH2 (Development Affecting Conservation Areas) of the adopted East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018 are relevant to the determination of this application.

## **REPRESENTATION**

One written objection to the application has been received. It is made on the grounds that the proposed glass canopy would:

- (i) extend over both the main door and the northernmost window thereby unbalancing the architectural façade of the building;
- (ii) damage the historic fabric of the façade because of the number of fixings required;
- (iii) form a 'dirt' and litter trap between the glass canopy and the stair turret;
- (iv) result in future signage and lettering being attached to the glass of the proposed canopy.

In all of the above the objector states that the proposals are contrary to Policies CH1 and CH2 of the adopted East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018.

In respect of point (iii), matters of littering are not a material consideration in the determination of an application for listed building consent.

In respect of point (iv), and on the matter of future signage and lettering being attached to the glass canopy, any signage to be displayed on it would require listed building consent and advertisement consent. However, the application drawings do not indicate the intention to display any adverts or signs on the proposed glass canopy.

## **PLANNING ASSESSMENT**

The building occupies a prominent position within the town centre of High Street in Haddington. It displays traditional features and materials including pitched roof slopes clad in slates, white painted stone walls, white painted timber framed sash and case windows with astragals and light blue painted window and door bands. Its stone coins are also painted in a light blue colour. A crenulated tower projects out from its principal front (west) elevation. Historically, a small flat roofed porch enclosed the front entrance doorway to the building. It had stone walls and a tooth shaped parapet to match the external walls and turret detail of the crenulated tower. The principal front (west) elevation of the building remains relatively unaltered and presents a consistent and uniform appearance of significant architectural or historic interest.

**Historic Environment Scotland (HES)**, in their consultation response to this application, state that 91 High Street is listed as being of special architectural or historic interest (Category B) and it is a predominately 18th century classical hotel building with possible earlier fabric dating back to the 16th century. They state that there are also early 19th century castellated tower additions, with the crenulated tower prominently sited on its principal elevation, and that it was one of the grandest buildings in Haddington.

HES note that the proposal is for the erection of a glass canopy on its principal elevation and would cover the main entrance of the building. They advise that extensions should not overlay principal elevations and must protect the character and appearance of a listed building. Accordingly, HES recommend that the current proposal be resisted to avoid damaging the principal elevation's traditional appearance and especially the distinctive crenulated tower that significantly contributes to the historic character and architectural interest of this listed building which is currently well preserved.

The proposed canopy would, due to its modern glazed form with stainless steel beams and posts, be markedly at odds with the architecture of the original and principal elevation of the listed building. It would visibly alter, and harmfully disrupt, the architectural form and uniform appearance of the principal front (west) elevation of the listed building. It would be a modern attachment to the front of the listed building that would not be in keeping with, or be complementary to, the architectural form, character or appearance of the listed building or of the built form of other listed buildings within this part of the streetscape. Instead, it would appear as a harmfully intrusive, incongruous and dominant addition that would be harmful to the special architectural or historic interest of the listed building. Moreover, by its method and number of fixings into the face of the stonework of the building, the proposed canopy would not serve to preserve nor enhance, but instead, would be harmful to the character, integrity and appearance of the listed building.

As these works detract from the special architectural or historic interest of the listed building, they would also harm the character or appearance of the Conservation Area.

On these considerations, the proposals are contrary to Policies CH1 and CH2 of the adopted East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018, the Historic Environment Policy for Scotland (HEPS): April 2019 and Scottish Planning Policy: June 2014.

## **RECOMMENDATION**

That listed building consent be refused for the following reason:

- 1 By virtue of its modern architectural form, size, scale, height, proportions, materials and position, the proposed canopy would radically alter, and harmfully disrupt, the architectural form and uniform appearance of the principal front (west) elevation of the listed building. It not be in keeping with, or be complementary to, the architectural form, character or appearance of the listed building or of the built form of other listed buildings within this part of the streetscape. Instead, it would appear as a harmfully intrusive, incongruous and dominant addition that would be harmful to the character and appearance of the listed building, contrary to Policies CH1 and CH2 of the adopted East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018, the Historic Environment Policy for Scotland (HEPS): April 2019 and Scottish Planning Policy: June 2014.