

REPORT TO: Planning Committee

MEETING DATE: Wednesday 4 March 2020

BY: Head of Development

SUBJECT: Application for Planning Permission for Consideration

Note - this application was called off the Scheme of Delegation List by Councillor Akhtar for the following reason: The planning application refers to the former George Hotel based within the town centre of Haddington. Planning permission is being sought for the erection of a canopy at the entrance of the building. The proposals merit discussion at the committee and I feel they try and preserve the integrity of the building and its historic aspects.

Application No. **19/01188/P**

Proposal Erection of canopy

Location **91 High Street
Haddington
East Lothian
EH41 3ET**

Applicant MNH (Haddington) Ltd

Per Somner Macdonald Architects

RECOMMENDATION Application Refused

REPORT OF HANDLING

PROPOSAL

This application relates to the former George Hotel, a predominantly 18th Century four storey building with crenulated tower, which occupies a prominent position on the north side of the eastern end of High Street in Haddington. The building is within the Town Centre of Haddington as defined by Policy TC2 of the adopted East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018. It is also within Haddington Conservation Area and it is listed as being of special architectural or historic interest (Category B).

Planning permission is sought for the addition of a glazed canopy that would abut, and project some 1.7 metres out from, the ground floor component of the front (west) elevation of the building. It would have three stainless steel beams that would be affixed into the stonework of the building and three stainless steel posts that would be affixed into the low stone wall which runs parallel to, and abuts the south end of, the frontage of the building.

The proposed canopy would measure some 1.7 metres wide, some 3.5 metres long and some 2.5 metres to the top of its mono-pitched roof at its highest point above ground level. It would be fully glazed and its north and south sides would be open sided. It would extend over the

front entrance doorway of the building and an adjacent window.

Through separate application 19/01289/LBC listed building consent is sought for erection of canopy. A separate report on application 19/01289/LBC is, at this time, on the Council's Committee Expedited List.

DEVELOPMENT PLAN

Section 25 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 requires that the application be determined in accordance with the development plan, unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

The development plan is the approved South East Scotland Strategic Development Plan (SESplan) and the adopted East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018.

There are no relevant policies of the approved South East Scotland Strategic Development Plan (SESplan). Policies TC2 (Town and Local Centres), CH1 (Listed Buildings), CH2 (Development Affecting Conservation Areas) and DP5 (Extensions and Alterations to Existing Buildings) of the adopted East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018 are relevant to the determination of the application.

Material to the determination of the application are Section 59 and 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 and the Scottish Government's policy on development affecting a listed building and within a conservation area given in Scottish Planning Policy: June 2014.

Scottish Planning Policy echoes the statutory requirements of Section 59 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 that in considering whether to grant planning permission for development which affects a listed building or its setting a planning authority shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

Scottish Planning Policy echoes the statutory requirements of Section 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 that a planning authority must have regard to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of a conservation area in exercising its responsibilities in the determination of any application for planning permission for development affecting a conservation area. It is stated in Scottish Planning Policy that proposed development within conservation areas and proposals outwith which will impact on its appearance, character or setting, should preserve or enhance the character and appearance of the conservation area. Proposals that do not harm the character and appearance of the conservation area should be treated as preserving its character and appearance.

REPRESENTATION

One written objection to the application has been received. It is made on the grounds that the proposed glass canopy would:

- (i) extend over both the main door and the northernmost window thereby unbalancing the architectural façade of the building;
- (ii) damage the historic fabric of the façade because of the number of fixings required;
- (iii) form a 'dirt' and litter trap between the glass canopy and the stair turret;
- (iv) result in future signage and lettering being attached to the glass of the proposed canopy.

In all of the above the objector states that the proposals are contrary to Policies CH1 and CH2 of the adopted East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018.

In respect of point (iii), matters of littering are controllable under legislation other than planning. Moreover, there is no evidence to substantiate the grounds of concern that the proposed glass canopy would trap 'dirt' or litter.

In respect of point (iv), and on the matter of future signage and lettering being attached to the glass canopy, only advertisement and listed building consent would be required for such a proposal. However, the application drawings do not indicate the intention to display any adverts or signs on the proposed glass canopy.

PLANNING ASSESSMENT

The building occupies a prominent position within the town centre of High Street in Haddington. It displays traditional features and materials including pitched roof slopes clad in slates, white painted stone walls, white painted timber framed sash and case windows with astragals and light blue painted window and door bands. Its stone coins are also painted in a light blue colour. A crenulated tower projects out from its principal front (west) elevation. Historically, a small flat roofed porch enclosed the front entrance doorway to the building. It had stone walls and a tooth shaped parapet to match the external walls and turret detail of the crenulated tower.

The proposed canopy would, due to its modern glazed form with stainless steel beams and posts, be markedly at odds with the architecture of the original and principal elevation of the listed building. It would visibly alter, and harmfully disrupt, the architectural form and uniform appearance of the principal front (west) elevation of the listed building. It would be a modern attachment to the front of the listed building that would not be in keeping with, or be complementary to, the architectural form, character or appearance of the listed building or of the built form of other listed buildings within this part of the streetscape. Instead, it would appear as a harmfully intrusive, incongruous and dominant addition that would be harmful to the special architectural or historic interest of the listed building. Moreover, by its method and number of fixings into the face of the stonework of the building, the proposed canopy would not serve to preserve nor enhance, but instead, would be harmful to the character, integrity and appearance of the listed building.

The buildings of Haddington High Street are largely 3 storey terraced buildings of a variety of architectural forms. They mostly have commercial premises on their ground floors with flats above. Where alterations to the frontages of the buildings have been allowed, including to the commercial frontages, these have been in keeping with the special architectural character of the buildings and with the character and appearance of the conservation area. Therefore the buildings of High Street both individually and as a group are an integral component of the Haddington Conservation Area and make a valuable contribution to its character and appearance.

There are a small number of commercial premises on the High Street that have canopies on their frontages. However, where they exist these are traditionally designed, fabricated, retractable canopies that are of a type traditionally found on a shop front. Consequently those canopies respect the architectural features of the building and do not harm the character and appearance of those buildings or the character and appearance of the conservation area.

In this instance the building of 91 High Street has not been designed to have a canopy attached to any part of its frontage. Thus in its attachment to the building it would not respect the architectural features of the building but instead would be harmful to it. Furthermore, in views of it from High Street the canopy would be seen as a modern glazed and steel structure markedly at odds with the architectural form, character and traditional materials of the existing frontages of the buildings of High Street. It would appear as a harmfully intrusive and incongruous addition to the front of the building that would be harmful to the character and appearance of the listed building and in turn to the character and appearance of Haddington

Conservation Area.

The proposed canopy would not have a harmful impact on the privacy and amenity of any neighbouring residential properties.

The Council's Road Services raise no objection to this planning application which does not conflict with Policy T2 of the adopted East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018.

Whilst on these considerations of privacy and amenity the proposed canopy does not conflict with Policies TC2 and DP5 of the adopted East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018, this does not outweigh the above conclusion that in its design, form and positioning, the proposed canopy is contrary to Policies CH1, CH2 and DP5 of the adopted East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018, the Historic Environment Policy for Scotland (HEPS): April 2019 and with Scottish Planning Policy: June 2014.

RECOMMENDATION

That planning permission be refused for the following reason:

- 1 The proposed canopy would be a harmfully intrusive, incongruous and dominant addition to the front elevation of the listed building. Therefore and by its method and number of fixings into the face of the stonework of the building, the proposed canopy would not serve to preserve nor enhance, but instead, would be harmful to the character, integrity and appearance of the listed building. Moreover the proposed canopy would be readily visible in public views of it from Haddington High Street where it would be seen as a modern glazed and steel structure markedly at odds with the architectural form, character and traditional materials of the existing frontages of the buildings of High Street and therefore harmful to the character and appearance of the Haddington Conservation Area contrary to Policies CH1, CH2 and DP5 of the adopted East Lothian Local Development Plan 2018, the Historic Environment Policy for Scotland (HEPS): April 2019 and with Scottish Planning Policy: June 2014..

In its attachment to the building the proposed canopy would not respect the architectural features of the building but instead would be harmful to it. Furthermore, in views of it from High Street the canopy would be seen as a modern glazed and steel structure markedly at odds with the architectural form, character and traditional materials of the existing frontages of the buildings of High Street. It would appear as a harmfully intrusive and incongruous addition to the front of the building that would be harmful to the character and appearance of the listed building and in turn to the character and appearance of Haddington Conservation Area.