

Statement in support of Local Review Body application ref 16/00701/P

The Applicant understands that refusal principally for reason that extension breaks the symmetry and at odds with design of the existing building, and it's similar neighbours.

These issues were raised during the application process by Historic Environment Scotland (HES) with their advice followed to reduce the size of the extension so that not fully obscuring the rear elevation. HES furthermore directed the Agent to 3 No. extensions to Listed Buildings in Hopetoun Terrace, Gullane where they had the same requirements. All three were approved. (08/00329/FUL, 12/00532/FUL & 14/01010/FUL)

The three Gullane applications are dated 2008, 2012 and 2014. These clearly post-date a refused extension in Fidra Avenue, Dirleton in 2001. Together with HES email approval this suggest a change in HES view on extensions to rear of Listed Buildings in both villages.

The Applicant respectfully asks that the Review Body make site visit to Fidra Avenue to consider design for themselves and review the three Gullane permissions. It is the Applicant's opinion that:

- refusal unreasonably ignores the appropriate design Consultee (HES)
- draws attention to timeline for positive pre-application comment and through application process where not advised of refusal due to 2001 application (01/00737/FUL)
- and also simply raises question as to why acceptable in Gullane but not Dirleton?

Historic Environment Scotland

Àrainneachd Eachdraidheil Alba

By E-mail

Environment & Technical Services
East Lothian Council
John Muir House
Haddington
EH41 3HA
nmillar@eastlothian.gov.uk

Longmore House
Salisbury Place
Edinburgh
EH9 1SH

Direct Line: 0131 668 8716
Switchboard: 0131 668 8600
HMConsultations@hes.scot

Our ref: HGG/A/LB/928
Our Case ID: 201600443
Your ref: PRE-APPLICATION

19 May 2016

Dear Sirs

Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997
11 Fidra Avenue, Dirleton
Statutory Designation: DIRLETON VILLAGE, 1-12 (INCLUSIVE NOS) FIDRA AVENUE
Designation Reference: B1529

Thank you for your pre-application consultation which we received on 27 April.

No 11 Fidra Avenue is part of a group of B-listed Arts and Crafts style houses, set within a cul-de-sac in the Dirleton Conservation Area. Designed by W J Walker Todd in 1919, their Arts and Crafts style is derived from the renowned Scottish architect Robert Lorimer's Colinton cottages. As with Lorimer's Colinton cottages, great care and consideration has been given to designing the buildings in the round. Each elevation is expressed in a unified Arts and Crafts style serving to reinforce the strong design inter-relationship with each other and their setting envelope.

With the above taken into account it is our view that the proposed current extension would have an adverse impact to the character and fabric of the rear elevation, which as noted is an intrinsic element of the overall composition of the house. It would obscure the entire ground floor extending round to the side elevation, remove significant levels of historic fabric, and, as the floor plan demonstrates, would be approximately the same area as that of the entire ground floor of the house.

Whilst we believe the principle of an extension to the building is achievable, we would strongly recommend that the size of the current extension is considerably reduced. As you will be aware we have been consulted by your council on a number of extensions to similar properties in Gullane on Hopetoun Terrace. We would suggest that the same broad design tenets that shaped these previous applications are adopted in this instance, particularly in regard to covering at most only half of the rear elevation.

We would be very happy to discuss this matter further, or if your council would find it beneficial attend a site visit. I can be contacted on 0131 668 8912.

Historic Environment Scotland

Àrainneachd Eachdraidheil Alba

Note

Historic Environment Scotland, HES, has a national remit for the Historic Environment, and as such does not provide detailed comments on every application. We consider consultations in national terms, and will decide whether to provide detailed advice depending on the scale, nature or complexity of the proposals.

A decision not to provide detailed comments or not to object should not be taken as support for the proposals by HES, and the application should be assessed as normal by your Council against local and national policy and guidance on the Historic Environment.

Detailed guidance on the application of National policy is set out in our 'Managing Change in the Historic Environment' series available online at <http://www.historic-scotland.gov.uk/managingchange>. Technical advice is available through our Technical Conservation website at <http://conservation.historic-scotland.gov.uk/>.

If you require any further information, please contact me as above.

Yours faithfully

James Turner
Senior Heritage Management Officer



HISTORIC
ENVIRONMENT
SCOTLAND

ÀRAINNEACHD
EACHDRAIDHEIL
ALBA

By E-mail

Environment & Technical Services
East Lothian Council
John Muir House
Haddington
EH41 3HA
nmillar@eastlothian.gov.uk

Longmore House
Salisbury Place
Edinburgh
EH9 1SH

Direct Line: 0131 668 8716
Switchboard: 0131 668 8600
HMConsultations@hes.scot

Our ref: HGG/A/LB/928
Our Case ID: 201602185
Your ref: PRE-APPLICATION
09 August 2016

Dear Sirs

Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997

11 Fidra Avenue, Dirleton

Statutory Designation: DIRLETON VILLAGE, 1-12 (INCLUSIVE NOS) FIDRA AVENUE

Designation Reference: B1529

Thank you for your pre-application consultation which we received on 21 July regarding the REVISED SCHEME - Single Storey extension to dwelling house at Category B Listed Building at the above address.

Historic Environment Scotland welcomes the revisions made by the applicant and we **do not** have any further comments to make on the proposals.

Note

Historic Environment Scotland has a national remit for the Historic Environment, and as such does not provide detailed comments on every application. We consider consultations in national terms, and will decide whether to provide detailed advice depending on the scale, nature or complexity of the proposals.

A decision not to provide detailed comments or not to object should not be taken as support for the proposals by Historic Environment Scotland, and the application should be assessed as normal by your Council against local and national policy and guidance on the Historic Environment.

Detailed guidance on the application of National policy is set out in our 'Managing Change in the Historic Environment' series available online at <https://www.historicenvironment.scot/advice-and-support/planning-and-guidance/legislation-and-guidance/managing-change-in-the-historic-environment-guidance-notes/> . Technical advice is available through our Technical Conservation website at <http://conservation.historic-scotland.gov.uk/> .

Yours faithfully

Historic Environment Scotland

Historic Environment Scotland – Longmore House, Salisbury Place, Edinburgh, EH9 1SH

Scottish Charity No. **SC045925**

VAT No. **GB 221 8680 15**

Copy email 10 August 2016 in support of LRB application 260117

From: Julian Frostwick [mailto:architecturejf@btconnect.com]

Sent: 10 August 2016 14:52

To: DAVID GREENAN

Subject: FW: Hitoric Environment Scotland response - 11 Fidra Avenue, Dirleton

Dave,

As discussed just to put a timeline on this for you.

- 25 February 2015 first drawings sent to you investigating how far out a full width extension could come before causing an overshadowing issue on neighbour's nearest window
- 3 April 2015 drawing sent to David Taylor, planner, for pre-application comment on shadow analysis on an extension full width over the rear elevation
- 23 April 2015 planner Craig Meikle responded that shadows ok. *(no comment from CM that rear extensions to Fidra Avenue properties not previously permitted)*
- 23 April 2015 JF advised David Taylor that Craig Meikle had responded that shadows ok. *(no comment in reply from DT that rear extensions to Fidra Avenue properties not previously permitted)*
- 1 October 2015 revised drawings submitted for pre-app comment.
- 7 October 2015 waiting to hear back from planners
- 21 October 2015 email received from Craig Meikle planner stating that wouldn't support an extension fully over rear as would be unbalanced/not harmonious/harmful to character integrity and appearance of listed building etc. *(no specific comment that rear extensions to Fidra Avenue properties not previously permitted)*
- 6 November 2015 Craig Meikle said on phone (and I emailed you after) that no point in having a meeting on site to discuss proposals, and **that a previous application circa 2000 had been refused**. He repeated that an 'unbalanced elevation', and was not accommodating when I suggested if ok if a neighbour also applied for an extension thereby balancing. He did suggest can come back with further revised drawings
- 10 November 2015 you asked for latest drawings so that you could discuss with Tim Day
- 24 November 2015 I forwarded on Craig Meikle's email of 21 October 2015 (I suspect you were seeing Tim Day that evening?)
- 21 March 2016 you and I met with Neil Millar who gave verbal ok to plans in principle for extension. You will recall that we agreed no need for him to put that on a duty enquiry form because he would only write that needs to see more detailed drawings and subject to Policy ENV1 etc etc. (I wish now we had insisted on him going to writing!) Extension still proposed fully across rear at this time. NM had asked that we increase roof pitch and that garage needed to be minimum 6m from roadway. *(asking for revision on roof pitch is hardly saying that proposal unacceptable due to 01/00737/FUL refusal?!)*
- 11 April 2016 I emailed you with drawings ready to submit back to Neil Millar prior to a formal application (noting I remember now having taken this with me on holiday to Wales!). You responded ok and drawings were emailed to NM
- 28 April 2016 NM advised has forwarded to Historic Environment Scotland (HES)
- 19 May 2016 HES reply that unhappy as obscures full rear elevation. Would be happy if reduced in size as per several in Hopetoun Terrace, Gullane. NM happy to provide further pre-app comment if revised drawings submitted *(Still nothing about complete unacceptability of a rear extension due to previous refusal)*
- 21 July 2016 revised drawing submitted with extension reduced in width so that not fully obscuring rear elevation and in line with those previously accepted by ELC and HES on similar properties in Hopetoun Terrace, Gullane

- 10 August 2016. NM advises that HES ok with proposals but ELC not due to refusal of application 01/00737/FUL

Apart from the incredible length of time taken for any of the planners to comment that would be a presumption against approval due to refusal of application 01/00737/FUL (which has allowed you to instruct my development of drawings at cost to you circa of £1950+VAT) I would strongly argue that the Hopetoun Terrace, Gullane applications post-date that and therefore suggest a changed opinion on properties of this type in Conservation villages. Gullane applications date 2008, 2012 and 2014 being permissions 08/00329/FUL, 12/00532/FUL, and 14/01010/FUL. (LBC references will match FUL)

I would also ask why Planners feel obliged to overrule the opinion of HES in this matter? Why did they not overrule HES in "the Hopetoun Terrace 3" if felt so strongly regards Fidra Avenue's 01/00737/FUL?

Advice is inconsistent at best. I leave with you.

Jules