

## Members' Library Service Request Form

|                           |  |
|---------------------------|--|
| Date of Document          | 07/06/13   |
| Originator                | Gary Fenwick   |
| Originator's Ref (if any) | GF/ES  |
| Document Title            | Proposed Synthetic Grass Pitches & Associated Works at Prestonpans, Dunbar and North Berwick |

Please indicate if access to the document is to be "unrestricted" or "restricted", with regard to the terms of the Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985.

|              |                                     |            |                          |
|--------------|-------------------------------------|------------|--------------------------|
| Unrestricted | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Restricted | <input type="checkbox"/> |
|--------------|-------------------------------------|------------|--------------------------|

If the document is "restricted", please state on what grounds (click on grey area for drop-down menu):

|                 |
|-----------------|
| For Publication |
|-----------------|

Please indicate which committee this document should be recorded into (click on grey area for drop-down menu):

|         |
|---------|
| Cabinet |
|---------|

Additional information:

|               |                                   |
|---------------|-----------------------------------|
| Authorised By | Monica Patterson                  |
| Designation   | Ex Dir (Services for Communities) |
| Date          | 11/06/13                          |

|                      |          |
|----------------------|----------|
| For Office Use Only: |          |
| Library Reference    | 166/13   |
| Date Received        | 19/07/13 |
| Bulletin             | Jul13    |

**REPORT TO:** Members' Library Service

**MEETING DATE:**

**BY:** Executive Director (Services for Communities)

**SUBJECT:** Proposed Synthetic Grass Pitches & Associated Works at Prestonpans, Dunbar and North Berwick

---

## **1 PURPOSE**

- 1.1 To note the decision to award the contract for the Proposed Synthetic Grass Pitches & Associated Works at Prestonpans, Dunbar and North Berwick to Messrs Greenfield (Allsports) UK Ltd, Glasgow.

## **2 RECOMMENDATIONS**

- 2.1 Cabinet is asked to note the decision of the Executive Director (Services for Communities) (per the Head of Housing & Environment) as appointed representative under Standing Order Rule 46 and delegation Appendix 2a (Tenders) thereto and after consultation with the Provost and the Head of Council Resources to accept Messrs Greenfield (Allsports) UK Ltd's tender amounting to £1,525,714.19 after checking, correction and evaluation and noting that it is open for consideration until 15 August 2013 for the Proposed Synthetic Grass Pitches & Associated Works at Prestonpans, Dunbar and North Berwick

## **3 BACKGROUND**

- 3.1 The 3G Pitches being delivered in Prestonpans, Dunbar and North Berwick are an extension to the initial 3G Pitch delivery within Musselburgh, Tranent and Haddington. The project is part of the Council's Legacy for London 2012 and Glasgow 2014 and has received Sports Lottery funding to support this. The 3G Pitches improve both the quality and capacity of pitch provision within the communities and make a significant difference to the training and playing of sport for the participants.
- 3.2 The procurement route chosen for this project was a Two Stage Contractor Selection process following established principles and utilising a weighted Quality and Price assessment criteria, with the aim of selecting the Most Economically Advantageous Tender.
- 3.3 A Pre-Qualification Questionnaire was lodged on the Public Contracts Scotland website inviting open submissions in February 2013. From an initial list of 10 submissions returned, and through a detailed assessment

process, a shortlist of 5 Contractors was established and processed to tender stage.

An Invitation to Tender was issued to 5 Contractors and tenders were returned on 25 April 2013. Initial assessment of these tenders indicated that Contractors had not priced on a like for like basis (through no fault of the tenderers) and therefore client requirements were clarified and Contractors invited to re-submit compliant, like for like bids by 17 May 2013. These tenders were subjected to detailed assessment on a Quality and Price basis and the value of tenders received was as follows:

| Ref | Contractor                            | Tender Amount Before Checking | Tender Amount After Checking | Preferred Best Value Tender Amount After Evaluation |
|-----|---------------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------------------|---|
| 1   | Fairways Sportsgrounds Renfrewshire   | £1,497,890.71                 | £1,497,890.71                |   |
| 2   | Greenfield (Allsports) UK Ltd Glasgow | £1,517,214.19                 | £1,525,714.19                | <u>£1,525,714.19</u>                                |
| 3   | Malcolm Sports Surfaces Renfrewshire  | £1,557,026.67                 | £1,557,026.67                |   |
| 4   | McCardle Sports-Tec Ltd Wallingford   | £1,731,426.70                 | £1,728,090.97                |   |
| 5   | Support in Sport, Maryport            | No Tender Received            |                              |   |

3.4 In addition to detailed compliance and arithmetic checks, the tenders were subjected to an Award Criteria process. This tender evaluation criteria included significant emphasis on quality and service in addition to price, and a tender evaluation matrix was used which covered the following aspects:

1. Experience
2. Company
3. Sustainability
4. Construction Quality
5. Recyclable Materials
6. Insurance Warranty Assistance
7. Quality Assurance
8. Tender Price

- 3.5 As indicated at 3.2 Messrs Greenfield (Allsports) UK Ltd's tender amounting to £1,525,714.19 after detailed checking and evaluation offers the Best Value from the Tenders submitted and has been competitively priced throughout.
- 3.6 As a result of the tender evaluation process Messrs Greenfield (Allsports) UK Ltd's tender submission was awarded an overall higher evaluation score than those of the other Tenderers. Messrs Greenfield (Allsports) UK Ltd scored consistently high in all award criteria demonstrating a sound understanding of the Council's requirements for this Contract. Attached is Appendix A – Summary of Quality/Price Scores.
- 3.7 The Contract has been prepared on a firm price basis in terms of the SBCC Design and Build Contract for Use in Scotland (2011 Edition) and the Contractor has undertaken to complete the works within 39 weeks from the date of commencement on site.

#### **4 COMMUNITY BENEFITS IN PROCUREMENT (CBIP)**

- 4.1 This proposed project has been allocated a requirement to achieve the following:

Minimum of 3 weeks work experience (1 week per pitch) and 1 company career talk at each of the local Secondary Schools.

#### **5 EQUALITIES IMPACT ASSESSMENT**

- 5.1 This Report is not applicable to the wellbeing of equalities groups and an Equalities Impact Assessment is not required.

#### **6 POLICY IMPLICATIONS**

- 6.1 None

#### **7 RESOURCE IMPLICATIONS**

- 7.1 Financial – Together with the addition of restricted ELC Professional Costs & Expenses, External Consultant and External CDM Co-ordinator Costs, the total project expenditure will not exceed £1,566,000.00 and has been approved by the Head of Council Resources.

This expenditure will be contained within amounts allocated for the Expansion of 3G Pitch Provision and Pavilions in the Council's approved Capital Investment Plan.

The budget is broken down as follows:

|                     |                      |
|---------------------|----------------------|
| ELC Capital Funding | £ 966,000.00         |
| Sportscotland Grant | <u>£ 600,000.00</u>  |
|                     | <u>£1,566,000.00</u> |

The major elements of this expenditure will be in the 2013/2014 financial year with the remaining retention monies allocated in the 2014/2015 financial year.

7.2 Personnel – None

7.3 Other – None

## **8 BACKGROUND PAPERS**

8.1 Appendix A – Summary of Quality/Price Scores.

|                      |  |
|----------------------|--|
| <b>AUTHOR'S NAME</b> | Richard Jennings                               |
| <b>DESIGNATION</b>   | Head of Housing & Environment                  |
| <b>CONTACT INFO</b>  | Gary Fenwick – Ext 7860<br>GF/ES – 7 June 2013 |

Appendix A

**3G Pitches at Prestonpans, Dunbar and North Berwick  
Quality / Price Score Summary**

|                    | Brock Pad<br>July start | <b>Alternative pad<br/>July start</b> | Alternative pad<br>September start |
|--------------------|-------------------------|---------------------------------------|------------------------------------|
| Fairways tender    | 1,608,025.90            | <b>1,497,890.71</b>                   | 1,497,890.71                       |
| Greenfields tender | 1,612,199.47            | <b>1,517,214.19 *</b>                 | 1,551,424.75                       |
| Malcolm tender     | 1,660,627.60            | <b>1,557,026.67</b>                   | 1,571,868.67                       |
| McArdle tender     | 1,855,042.97            | <b>1,728,090.97</b>                   | 1,743,450.97                       |

\* See note at bottom of page

**Price Score**

Agreed to score the Alternative pad with the July start

Fairways:

Lowest price scores 100 x 70% = 70.00

Greenfields:

Price is 1.29% more than lowest price therefore  
score out of 100 is 98.71 x 70% = 69.10

Malcolm:

Price is 3.95% more than lowest price therefore  
score out of 100 is 96.05 x 70% = 67.24

McArdle:

Price is 15.37% more than lowest price therefore  
score out of 100 is 84.63 x 70% = 59.24

**Quality Score**

Greenfields: Score 88.34 from 120.00

Maximum 100 x 30% = 30.00

Malcolm: Score 85.17 from 120.00

3.59% less than highest score therefore  
96.41 x 30% = 28.92

McArdle: Score 66.67 from 120.00

24.53% less than highest score therefore  
75.47 x 30% = 22.64

Fairways: Score 62.32 from 120.00

29.45% less than highest score therefore  
70.55 x 30% = 21.17

**Combined Quality / Price Score**

|             |              |              |           |
|-------------|--------------|--------------|-----------|
| Greenfields | Quality      | 30.00        |           |
|             | Price        | 69.10        |           |
|             | <b>Total</b> | <b>99.10</b> | 1st place |
| Malcolm     | Quality      | 28.92        |           |
|             | Price        | 67.24        |           |
|             | <b>Total</b> | <b>96.16</b> |           |
| Fairways    | Quality      | 21.17        |           |
|             | Price        | 70.00        |           |
|             | <b>Total</b> | <b>91.17</b> |           |
| McArdle     | Quality      | 22.64        |           |
|             | Price        | 59.24        |           |
|             | <b>Total</b> | <b>81.88</b> |           |

\* Clarification of final Tender figure as contained within the Members Library Service Report

Greenfield's assessed tender amount as above - £1,517,214.19

Agreed addition of a Provisional sum to cover  
additional Planning requirements notified  
post tender evaluation - £8,500.00

Total revised Greenfields Tender Amount as  
contained within the Members Library  
Service Report - £1,525,714.19