

REPORT TO: Planning Committee

MEETING DATE: Tuesday 4 September 2012

BY: Executive Director (Services for Communities)

SUBJECT: Application for Planning Permission for Consideration

Application No. **11/00663/LBC**

Proposal Alterations to buildings, erection of walls, part demolition of buildings and walls

Location **Begbie Farm Steading
Begbie
Haddington
East Lothian
EH41 4HQ**

Applicant H and K Enterprises Limited

Per Smith Architects

Ward 6

RECOMMENDATION Consent Granted

PLANNING ASSESSMENT

The application site is at Begbie Farm, which is located in the countryside to the southwest of Haddington.

The application site comprises the buildings of Begbie Farm Steading and some areas of agricultural land. It is rectangular in shape, with a small rectangular area projecting from the southeast corner. The site is some 0.78 hectares in area. The majority of the steading buildings are listed as being of special architectural or historic interest (Category B). These listed buildings consist of a large rectangular central range, a small rectangular eastern range, a long rectangular southern range and a 'T' shaped northern range. They are a variety of one, one and a half, and two storeys in height. Along the north-eastern boundary of the site are three small modern agricultural buildings and close to the southwest boundary are two large modern agricultural buildings.

The site is bounded to the north by agricultural land with houses beyond, to the northeast by a field used for the keeping of horses and by Begbie Farmhouse and its garden with the C67 public road and agricultural land beyond and to the southeast by another part of the C67 public road with agricultural land beyond. To the southwest and northwest it is

bounded by agricultural land. Begbie Farmhouse is Category C(S) listed as being of special architectural or historic interest.

The listed steading buildings are all built of random rubble stone with dressed stone quoins, including around the major openings. The design of the buildings makes extensive use of gables. The roofs of the buildings are pitched and clad with pantiles.

The modern agricultural buildings on the northeast and southwest of the site are utilitarian, metal framed and metal clad agricultural buildings. The application drawings detail an intention to demolish those utilitarian buildings. They are not listed as being of special architectural or historic interest and their demolition does not require listed building consent.

Listed building consent is sought for alterations to the group of steading buildings, the erection of walls, fencing and gates and for the part demolition of buildings and walls. Additionally some modern, utilitarian features and additions would be removed.

Planning permission is sought separately through application 11/00663/P for the conversion of the whole group of steading buildings to form 15 houses and for associated works. A separate report on application 11/00663/P is, at this time, on the Scheme of Delegation List.

Section 25 of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 requires that the application be determined in accordance with the development plan, unless material considerations indicate otherwise.

The development plan is the approved Edinburgh and the Lothians Structure Plan 2015 and the adopted East Lothian Local Plan 2008.

Relevant to the determination of the application are Policy ENV1C (International and National Historic or Built Environment Designations) of the approved Edinburgh and the Lothians Structure Plan 2015 and Policies ENV3 (Listed Buildings) and DP8 (Replacement Windows) of the adopted East Lothian Local Plan 2008.

Material to the determination of the application are Sections 14 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 and the Scottish Government's policy on development affecting a listed building given in the Scottish Historic Environment Policy: December 2011 and Scottish Planning Policy: February 2010.

The Scottish Historic Environment Policy and Scottish Planning Policy echo the statutory requirements of Section 14 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 that in considering whether to grant listed building consent for any works to a listed building the planning authority shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.

Also material to the determination of the application are the written representation from the public. Two written objections have been received. Both objections have been lodged by a planning consultant on behalf of the family who own and live in Begbie Farmhouse. The grounds of objection are that:

(i) Due to its countryside location the proposed conversion of the steading buildings to houses is inconsistent with Scottish Planning Policy: February 2010 and development plan policy on new housing in the countryside;

(ii) No design statement has been submitted, conflicting with Scottish Government Planning Advice Note 68: Design Statements and Policy DP4 of the adopted East Lothian Local Plan;

(iii) There is no justification for enabling development to fund the restoration of the listed buildings;

(iv) The farm buildings are not redundant and therefore there is no justification for their conversion;

(v) The demolition would harm the historic character of the listed buildings;

(vi) The bat survey and archaeological assessment submitted with the application give little reassurance and appear vague in their conclusions as to the likelihood of the proposals causing harm to natural and historic interests. The possibility of bats being present mean that there is a likelihood of a criminal offence being committed if any permission for conversion were to be implemented;

(vii) There is no assessment of place, identity or context. Begbie has no facilities and is unsuitable for new residential development;

(viii) Poor layout and lack of amenity space;

(ix) The proposals relate poorly to the existing 'hamlet' of Begbie; and

(x) The site has poor road access and raises road safety concerns, with most traffic likely to head towards Edinburgh or Haddington and having to negotiate a dangerous blind corner.

Only ground (v) of the above objections are material to the determination of this application for listed building consent. The other matters are considered in relation to application for planning permission 11/00663/P.

One written comment has been received. A letter from the Architectural Heritage Society of Scotland states that the society is impressed and encouraged by the general treatment of the listed steading. Their other comments are considered in relation to application for planning permission 11/00663/P.

Removal from the site of the utilitarian agricultural sheds to the south of the group of steading buildings would serve to enhance the character and setting of the Category B listed steading, and of the Category C(S) listed Begbie Farmhouse.

The central range of the listed steading buildings is formed of 4 parallel sections with northwest and southeast facing gables. To facilitate the formation of four of the proposed houses this range would be significantly altered by the removal of the greater part of the two central sections of it. An existing internal stone wall of the south part of the range would have window openings formed in it. The openings of the eastern and western sections of this range would have timber walls built up behind the line of existing metal columns to allow those columns to remain exposed. Glazed panels and windows would be formed in the new timber elevations. So altered the central range would have a 'U'-shaped form around a northwest facing courtyard. The central part of the northwest facing elevation, with its large cartshed openings would be retained to wallhead height to complete the courtyard. Thus the central range of the steading buildings would retain the character of its existing rectangular shape.

Where possible, existing window and door openings would be used. Existing timber openings on the external elevations of the central range would be glazed and no new openings would be formed. The south elevation of the south range of the steading buildings faces the C67 public road. It is the main publicly viewed elevation of the listed steading buildings. No new openings would be formed in that elevation wall. Three roof windows would be formed on the central part of the roof slope of part of this range. Thus the character and appearance of that main public elevation of the south range would not be significantly altered. Only two new openings would be formed in the north elevation of the south range. Roof windows formed on the north facing roof slope of that range would be face into the group of steading buildings and not outwardly to public views. No new openings would be formed in the gable elevations of the south range.

No new openings would be formed in the east elevation of the east range. Two existing window openings on the west elevation would be altered to form doorways and one new window opening would be formed. Roof windows would be installed on the west facing roof slope so as to line up with the openings on the west elevation. Existing openings on the south gable would be glazed. The elevation walls of the north range have few existing openings in them. In addition to these existing openings, several new window openings would be formed on each of its elevations.

By virtue of their number and positioning, the proposed new and altered openings and the proposed new roof windows would not harm the architectural character and appearance of the steading buildings.

New openings for windows and doors would be finished with dressed natural stone lintols, cills and rybats.

There are few existing windows remaining in the existing openings of the buildings. The applicant's Window Survey demonstrates that these remaining windows are either beyond repair or are later replacements which are not appropriate to the listed buildings. Replacement and new windows would be constructed of timber frames and fitted with 'Slimlite' double glazing. They would be casement windows with astragals. For fixed and larger glazed openings, the glazing would be single pain and would be set back within the openings.

Subject to the proposed roof lights being installed as near flush as possible with the upper surface of the roof into which they would be installed, and the glazing to larger openings being set back in those openings, these proposed alterations would not harm the special architectural or historical interest of the group of listed steading buildings.

The stone walls of the buildings would be repaired and repointed. Pantiled roofs would be re-clad with new clay pantiles. Existing and new rainwater goods would be in cast iron. No details of roof ventilation or of flues and wall mounted vents to be installed on the buildings have been submitted. To safeguard the special architectural or historic interest of the steading buildings it should be made a condition on the grant of planning permission that details of roof ventilation measures and the visible part of any new flues and vents be submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority prior to their use in the proposed development.

All of the above proposed alterations to the buildings, including the part demolition of the central range, are compatible with and would not harm any significant architectural features of the buildings and would be in keeping with the size, form, scale, proportions, massing and architectural character of the buildings. Nor would they be harmful to the special architectural or historic interest of the Category B listed steading buildings.

Historic Scotland raise no objection to the proposed conversion of the steading buildings. They do not consider that any complex or sensitive issues are raised by the proposals. They had expressed concern at the proposed astragal thickness of the new and replacement windows. The revised plans submitted by the applicant show an astragal thickness of some 28 mm rather than the 36 mm originally proposed, thus addressing Historic Scotland's concern on this detailed aspect of the application.

The proposed alterations and selective demolitions are, as applicable consistent with Policy ENV1C of the approved Edinburgh and the Lothians Structure Plan 2015, Policies ENV3 and DP8 of the adopted East Lothian Local Plan 2008 and with the Scottish Historic Environment Policy: December 2011 and Scottish Planning Policy: February 2010.

RECOMMENDATION:

That listed building consent be granted subject to the following conditions:

- 1 The works to implement this listed building consent shall begin before the expiration of 3 years from the date of this grant of listed building consent.

Reason:

Pursuant to Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997

- 2 No development shall take place until details of roof ventilation measures have been submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority and the ventilation measures used shall accord with the details so approved.

Reason:

To safeguard the character and appearance of the buildings listed as being of special architectural or historic interest.

- 3 All new and replacement stone to be used in the development shall be natural stone to match as closely as possible the existing stonework of the buildings, in accordance with a sample to be submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority prior to its use in the development and the stone used shall accord with the sample so approved.

Reason:

To safeguard the character and appearance of the buildings listed as being of special architectural or historic interest.

- 4 All new stonework, including infill stonework for the existing steading buildings shall match as closely as possible the existing stonework of the walls of the existing steading buildings and all the pointing or re-pointing of that stonework shall comprise a lime-based mortar, which shall match, as closely as possible, the existing lime pointing.

Prior to commencement of limework a detailed specification for limework together with details of the lime specialist contractor to be used, shall be submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority. The specification shall include a timetable for the limework; and also details of the masonry preparation; lime mortar mix, showing type of lime, aggregate and proportions and protective measures for the limework during and after the work being carried out. The specification shall be based on a lime specialist's analysis of and report on the building, and a copy of this analysis and report shall be included with the detailed submission for this condition.

Reason:

To safeguard the character and appearance of the buildings listed as being of special architectural or historic interest.

- 5 Samples of replacement pantiles to be used in the development shall be provided for the prior inspection and approval of the Planning Authority and the replacement pantiles used shall accord with the samples so approved.

Reason:

To safeguard the character and appearance of the buildings listed as being of special architectural or historic interest.

- 6 The following shall be finished in a colour to be approved in advance by the Planning Authority and the colour of the finish applied shall accord with the details so approved:

1. the external face of all new and replacement exterior timber boarded doors, walls and timber boarded infill panels;

2. the external face of the frames of all new and replacement glazed doors, screens and infill panels;

3. the external face of the frames of all new and replacement windows.

Reason:

To safeguard the character and appearance of the buildings listed as being of special architectural or historic interest.

- 7 Samples of the new and replacement windows to be used in the development shall be provided for the inspection and approval of the Planning Authority prior to them being installed on the buildings.

Reason:

To safeguard the character and appearance of the buildings listed as being of special architectural or historic interest.

- 8 The glazed doors and windows to be installed in existing door, cart arch and other large openings of the steading buildings shown on the approved drawings docketed to this listed building consent shall be installed as far back within those openings as possible, to a detail to be submitted to and approved in writing in advance by the Planning Authority.

Reason:

To safeguard the character and appearance of the buildings listed as being of special architectural or historic interest.

- 9 All roof windows shall be 'conservation type' roof windows and shall be installed as near to a flush fitting as possible with the roof surface and with minimum required flashing.

Reason:

To safeguard the character and appearance of the buildings listed as being of special architectural or historic interest.

- 10 Prior to their installation on the buildings, details of any flue and vent outlets shall be submitted to and approved by the Planning Authority. Details shall include scale 1:5 or 1:10 section drawings and brochures showing the size, design and numbers of the proposed flue and vent outlets. The details shall show the flue and vent outlets concealed as much as possible and for visible parts to match as closely as possible the colour and materials of the part of the buildings to which they would adjoin.

Reason:

To safeguard the character and appearance of the buildings listed as being of special architectural or historic interest.

- 11 All new and replacement cast iron rainwater goods shall be painted a colour to be approved in advance by the Planning Authority and the colour of the paint applied to them shall accord with the detail so approved.

Reason:

To safeguard the character and appearance of the buildings listed as being of special architectural or historic interest.

- 12 No fascia boards shall be installed behind the gutters on the buildings. All new and replacement sections of guttering shall only be attached to the steading buildings using sarking straps.

Reason:

To safeguard the character and appearance of the buildings listed as being of special architectural or historic interest.

- 13 Prior to their use in the development a schedule and samples of the materials and finishes for the biomass boiler building hereby approved shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority and the materials and finishes of the biomass boiler building shall be in accordance with the schedule and samples so approved.

Reason:

To enable the Planning Authority to control the materials, finishes and colour to be used to achieve a development of good quality and appearance to safeguard the character and appearance of the buildings listed as being of special architectural or historic interest.